



**NAPIER**  
CITY COUNCIL

*Te Kaunihera o Ahuriri*

Napier Civic Building  
231 Hastings Street

**t +64 6 835 7579**

**e [info@napier.govt.nz](mailto:info@napier.govt.nz)**

**[www.napier.govt.nz](http://www.napier.govt.nz)**

# ORDINARY MEETING OF COUNCIL

## Open Attachments Under Separate Cover

---

Meeting Date: Tuesday 7 August 2018

---

Time: 3.00pm

---

Venue: Council Chamber  
Hawke's Bay Regional Council  
159 Dalton Street  
Napier

---

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Item 2</b>	<b>Representation Review - Appeals and Objections</b>
Attachment A	Summary of Appeals/ Objections Received.....2

## Summary of Appeals and Objections Received by 3 August 2018

### Appeals

There were no appeals received from any of the submitters to the Initial Proposal.

### Objections

There were two objections received to the Final Proposal.

Objector	Objection
Anthony McLagan	<p>This objection is on the grounds that the proposed change to a ward-only system is partly based on the failure of ward councillors in Auckland to reign in the activities of their two recent Socialist mayors, and ward councillors having little power to reign in the excesses and salaries of council organisations and staff.</p> <p>Mayor Len Brown was a fornicator of his mistress on council premises and got little more than a smack on the hand from lily-livered ward councillors.</p> <p>Mayor Phil Goff has denied the exercise of free speech on council premises with the connivance of the present crop of lily-livered ward councillors.</p> <p>Which begs the question: If the system in Napier aint broke, why fix it?</p> <p>Some points to ponder,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The population of Napier, at a national level, is serviced by a single MP as is every other electorate</li> <li>• At the local level it takes 12 councillors and a Mayor to service a similar population</li> <li>• Without "at large councillors" the council has no "mana"</li> <li>• It does not take 4 councillors, in a ward, to actively service that ward. The fourth councillor is likely to be no more than a passenger anyway.</li> </ul>

	<p>• In every community there are potential candidates who have the future of their city as a priority over parish pump politics. These candidates put themselves forward to address city wide issues. Ward-only councillors as seen in the Auckland experiment leads to the dumbing down and ineffectiveness of council. One reason why central government has had to step in and prop up their infrastructure.</p> <p>I firmly believe that the present arrangements have served Napier well and allow for a mix of councillors who have the ratepayers interests at heart.</p> <p>I recommend no change. However, as an alternative to the present proposal, I recommend that councillors for Nelson Park and Taradale be reduced to 3 each, and a minimum of 2 “at large” councillors be elected.</p>
Clayton Fippard	<p>I want to object to the NCC’s decision to change the current voting system.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(i) The decision seems to be guided by the public’s submissions. There were only 37 in total. Statistically not significant. The professionals, SIL research, used a sample of ≈600. The results were clear. Only 11% of ≈600 wanted a ward system – 66 people, self- selected. 22 submitters out of the 37 wanted a ward system, it’s the same people!</li> <li>(ii) Let’s think a bit, what if we had a single ward? Each citizen would have a say in electing 12 councillors. What if we had two wards? Each citizen can only choose 6 councillors, the value of their vote has halved. What if we have 3 wards? You can see how this works and you can’t argue with it because its true.</li> <li>(iii) The current ‘mixed system’ has led to perverse outcomes as the ladies that prepared the review analysis pointed out (chart 4 Number of ward candidates under the mixed system.) In 2010 in the Onekawa/ Tamatea seat, only one candidate stood and in the Taradale ward only two candidates stood for two seats. This is not democracy. IN 2007 only nine candidates stood for six seats. Democracy, good luck with that.</li> <li>(iv) Everyone is missing the obvious. Why the lack of Māori representation? It’s never mentioned. They have rights like everybody else.</li> </ul> <p>Summary. I believe if the voting system should be changed, it should be done with a public referendum at the time of the next vote. Let the people decide how elections are run, its’ their election not the politicians.</p>