

FUTURE NAPIER COMMITTEE

Open Minutes

Meeting Date: Thursday 6 May 2021

Time: 11.22am – 12.55pm

Venue Council Chambers
Hawke's Bay Regional Council
159 Dalton Street
Napier

Livestreamed via Council's Facebook site

Present Mayor Wise, Deputy Mayor Brosnan (In the Chair), Councillors Boag, Browne, Chrystal, Crown, Mawson, McGrath, Price, Simpson, Tapine, and Taylor

In Attendance Chief Executive (Steph Rotarangi)
Director Corporate Services (Adele Henderson)
Director Infrastructure Services, (Jon Kingsford)
Acting Director City Strategy (Rachael Horton)
Pou Whakarae (Mōrehu Te Tomo)
Manager Communications and Marketing (Craig Orborn)
Manager Community Strategies (Natasha Mackie)
Team Leader Planning and Compliance (Luke Johnson)
Senior Project Manager (Drew Brown)

Also In Attendance **Public Forum:**

- Alan Rhodes, War Memorial Recovery Group
- Alan Lawton, John and Kevin Purcell, members of the Napier Returned Services Association (RSA)

Craig Morley and Dorothy Pilkington (Community members of the Roll of Honour Subcommittee) (Item 2)
James Blackburn (44Architects) *via zoom link (Item 3)*

Administration Governance Advisors (Carolyn Hunt and Anna Eady)

Apologies

Councillors Mawson / Simpson

That the apology from Councillor Wright be accepted.

Carried

Conflicts of interest

Deputy Mayor Brosnan declared a conflict of interest in Item One – Resource Consent Activity Update

Public forum

Mr Alan Rhodes, War Memorial Recovery Group advised that he had been involved in the War Memorial issue since April 2017 and stated that an agreement had been entered into by the Government and Napier City Council in the 1950s which created a very clear Charitable Trust where Council would exercise a maintenance and caretaking role of the memorial as trustee on behalf of the citizens of the city. Changing the War Memorial in to a commercial centre was contrary to Trust law.

Mr Rhodes spoke of the importance of memory and acknowledged the passing of Charlie Mardon, Jeremy Nash and the original architect Guy Natusch who died six months ago just short of his 100th birthday. Mr Natusch would always be remembered for his loyalty and efforts by the War Memorial Recovery Group.

Mr Rhodes advised that the Group did not wish to see a division between a new War Memorial which is a garden or landscaped area and the buildings being mainly commercially used by the Napier City Council. The entire building must be the Napier War Memorial Centre.

Alan Lawton, Napier Returned Services Association (RSA) spoke briefly to the meeting advising that the RSA were fully supportive of the concept design for the Napier War Memorial Centre. The plans had been displayed at the Napier RSA and patrons seemed happy with the design.

The RSA looked forward to Council moving forward with the detailed designs and considered that consultation with the RSA had been pretty good. He said it would be nice to have the War Memorial Centre completed and ready for ANZAC Day 2022.

Announcements by the Mayor

Long Term Plan – Mayor Wise - Reminder to anybody on livestream that Council was currently consulting on the Long Term Plan and would love to hear views on topics in the consultation document and any other feedback. Submissions to the Long Term Plan close on 12 May 2021.

Community Services Grant - Councillor Boag – Reminder that the deadline for applying for a Community Services Grant was 14 May 2021. The Community Services Grant is a contribution from Napier City Council to the community not-for-profit sector that help look after

Napier's residents. This fund helps community organisations to provide services which benefit the wider Napier community. Forms are available on the Council website.

Youth Week – Councillor McGrath – Advised that Youth Week runs 8-16 May 2021. The Youth Council were running a number of events including a Youth Market day, Living Library, Beach Clean-up day, quiz night, celebrating cultural DiverCity, Sunday skating sessions and online events. View the Youth Council Facebook site for dates and times.

Announcements by the Chairperson

Nil

Announcements by Management

Nil

Confirmation of minutes

Councillors Boag / Mawson

That the Minutes of the meeting held on 25 March 2021 were taken as a true and accurate record of the meeting.

Carried

Minor Matters

- Gaming Grant application by Council

AGENDA ITEMS

Having previously declared a conflict of interest in Item 1, Deputy Mayor Brosnan vacated the Chair and Councillor Tapine, Deputy Chair assumed the role of Chair for this item.

1. RESOURCE CONSENT ACTIVITY UPDATE

Type of Report:	Enter Significance of Report
Legal Reference:	Enter Legal Reference
Document ID:	1278530
Reporting Officer/s & Unit:	Luke Johnson, Team Leader Planning and Compliance

1.1 Purpose of Report

This report provides an update on recent resource consenting activity. The report is provided for information purposes only, so that there is visibility of major projects and an opportunity for elected members to understand the process.

Applications are assessed by delegation through the Resource Management Act (RMA); it is not intended to have application outcome discussions as part of this paper.

This report only contains information which is lodged with Council and is publicly available.

At the Meeting

The Team Leader Planning and Compliance, Mr Johnson, spoke to the report providing a brief overview, and noted that there has been an increase in applications received in comparison to the same time last year.

- Councillor Tapine asked whether with an increase in resource activity there was significant commercial waste taken to the landfill, and whether consideration could be given to an economic drive on the environmental effect. The officer noted that currently there was no obligation on the developer to take any measures to reduce waste and there was no resourcing to allow for this.

ACTION The Manager Environmental Solutions to provide an update to Councillors by memo on commercial waste and the environmental effect at the Omarunui Landfill.

Committee's recommendation

Councillors Price / Taylor

The Future Napier Committee:

- a. Note the resource consent activity update.

Carried

Deputy Brosnan re-assumed the role as Chair and continued the meeting.

2. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT - REPAIR AND REINSTATMENT OF THE NAPIER WAR MEMORIAL ORIGINAL ROLL OF HONOUR PLAQUES

<i>Type of Report:</i>	Information
<i>Legal Reference:</i>	N/A
<i>Document ID:</i>	1303790
<i>Reporting Officer/s & Unit:</i>	Helen Barbier, Team Leader Governance

2.1 Purpose of Report

This report was to include in the agenda the Future Napier Committee Chair's report in relation to the Napier War Memorial Roll of Honour Subcommittee recommendations on repairing and restoring the original World War I and II Roll of Honour plaques.

The Chairperson's recommendation was to approve the Napier War Memorial Roll of Honour Subcommittee recommendations to repair and restore the original war memorial plaques displaying the original World War I and World War II Roll of Honour.

At the Meeting

Circulated at the meeting was an Excerpt from the Council minutes of a meeting held on 5 March 2019 (Doc ID 1312259). This included the recommendations from the Strategy and Infrastructure Committee meeting held on 19 February 2019 relating to reports on the "Napier Roll of Honour" and "War Memorial Design Options Consultation". The recommendations became Council Resolutions.

Community members of the Roll of Honour (RoH) Subcommittee, Dorothy Pilkington and Craig Morley introduced the recommendations providing some background on the reason why the subcommittee was set up.

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS) was discussed three years ago. One of the provisos when undertaking change to a heritage building was the preservation of all possible existing fabric, being the reinstatement of the existing roll and not throwing it away.

Guy Natusch, the original architect had asked for a heritage architect to become involved and Chris Cochrane conservation architect, Jeremy Salmon and James Blackburn (44Architects) had been consulted and agreed all three existing rolls must be incorporated back into the building.

The Brief was to include an extended electronic roll incorporating the names that had been researched and added to the roll. It had been a long process and the subcommittee had advocated for the principles in reinstating the original fabric which were all supported by the heritage architects.

- The plaques weathered the elements for 65 years and architects had provided a long report on the conservation and management of the plaques for the future.
- A great deal of names had been identified through a robust process Council ran in 2018 but left Council with 1000 names to add.
- The RoH Subcommittee considered new names would be memorialised in stone where there was a request for that to occur either by a family member or the

community at large and where there were no objections to that name being memorialised in stone.

- Names, where there were no requests for them to be memorialised in stone would be memorialised in the “Living Roll” only until such a time as they could be added in stone, if a future request was made.
- The Roll moved and changed over time as new research came to light and it would be reasonable to expect that additional names would be added in stone over time and the recommendations reflected this.
- The subcommittee were recommending that additional names were included in the same manner that had occurred in 1995 on additional plaques in alphabetical order at a certain time and added to the certain conflicts.
- Appendix 1 ongoing management of living roll – the task was to consider the roll of honour as per the resolution – reinstatement to outside of the building. Physical plaques intended for the outside in conjunction with two electronic plaques which would contain the living roll names that have yet to be proven and researched properly and immortalised in stone.
- On the inside of the building, they proposed a more extended living roll with a touch screen that would contain all of the information and research that has been obtained of the fallen ie stories from families, images, references etc. It would be completely interactive and the community could do more research and add information.
- Names of rooms within the building will commemorate those on the roll.
- Separate papers on management policy for the War Memorial Design, the Floral Clock and the War Memorial Centre as per recommendation (d) would be brought back to Council.
- The 28th Maori Battalion touch screen table would be available to move around the region and possibly an opportunity for the MTG and War Memorial Centre to host at the War Memorial Centre and invite 28th Māori Battalion family members to record a message or add photos to the Living Roll.

The Chair suspended Standing Orders 21.6 to allow all Councillors the opportunity to speak to the Motion.

Committee's recommendation

Mayor Wise / Councillor Crown

The Future Napier Committee:

- a. Note the Chairperson’s report: “Repair and Reinstatement of the Original Napier War Memorial Roll of Honour Plaques” dated 6 May 2021.

Carried

Committee's recommendation

Mayor Wise / Councillor Crown

- a) Approve the Napier War Memorial Roll of Honour Subcommittee’s recommendations (*Doc Id 1312639*) and in full, including to repair and restore the original War Memorial Roll of Honour (RoH) plaques.
- b) Endorse the Salmond Reed Architects report titled Napier War Memorial Hall: War Memorial Plaques Recommendations on Repairs and Reinstatement (*Doc ID. 1304702*).

- c) Note there are a number of work streams that will commence to implement in the recommendations including RoH research, draft list finalisation, community publishing, ongoing RoH guardianship structure, stonemasonry restoration and recreation work.
- d) Note separate papers are coming to Council covering the related topics on: The War Memorial Design, the Floral Clock and the War Memorial Centre Management Policy.
- e) Note the recommendations on the naming convention, removal of names and full engraving of new names differ from the Strategy and Infrastructure Committee resolution of 19 February 2019 and Council adoption on 5 March 2019.
- f) Confirms the revocation of the Council Resolutions made on 5 March 2019, in the confirmation of the Strategy and Infrastructure Committee Meeting held 19 February 2019, item two paper entitled "Napier Roll Of Honour", resolutions (a) and (b) as follows:
 - a) *Approve the Napier Roll of Honour as an official Civic list of war dead for display at the War Memorial Centre site, and:*
 - b) *Approve that 15 identified names from the 1995 Roll of Honour deemed by research to have good and legitimate reason for removal are not carried forward to the revised Roll of Honour.*

In accordance with Standing orders 24.6 and cl. 30 (6) Schedule 7, of the Local Government Act 2002.

Carried

Attachments

- 1 Recommendations of War Memorial Roll of Honour Subcommittee referred to in Future Napier Recommendation (a)
- 2 Excerpt from the Council Minutes of 5 March 2019

3. CONCEPT DESIGN FOR NAPIER WAR MEMORIAL CENTRE

Type of Report:	Contractual
Legal Reference:	N/A
Document ID:	1306976
Reporting Officer/s & Unit:	Drew Brown, Senior Project Manager

3.1 Purpose of Report

To seek Council adoption of the Concept Design for the Perpetual Flame, Roll of Honour, and remembrance/reflection space at the Napier War Memorial Centre, to enable the project to progress to detailed design and construction stages.

At the Meeting

The Senior Project Manager, Mr Brown provided a brief summary of the report and consultations that had been undertaken. There had been several stages of consultations and designs to address how to reinstate the various remembrance elements to the War Memorial. The iteration at the moment had a lot of consultation input from specialist heritage architects, who were brought on board at the request of the original architect Guy Natusch.

Circulated at the meeting was a colour flyer (*Doc Id 1313170*) of the concept design of the War Memorial Centre.

Mr Blackburn of 44Architect displayed a PowerPoint presentation (*Doc Id 1312632*) that was presented at the public meetings and workshops and provided commentary on the design.

A video on the Napier Wall Memorial concept design fly through was also displayed at the meeting. (<https://www.napier.govt.nz/napier/projects/the-napier-war-memorial-restoration/>)

The Chair suspended Standing Order 26.1 to allow all members the opportunity to speak.

- The entranceway was not included in the Architects Brief, however expanding that to the design stage would be prudent and allay some fears expressed at public meetings.
- Due to vandalism that has occurred in the past, protection and access to the Floral Clock and where it would be viewed from should be included in the report that was to come back to Council
- Ensure pathways to plaques are wide enough for pushchairs and mobility scooters.
- The name Napier War Memorial Conference Centre created controversy around the word "Conference" being included in the title and is now referred to as the "Napier War Memorial Centre".
- This was a concept design and seating would be included in the detailed design and was included as part of the recommendations.
- Include an additional recommendation to extend the scope of the detailed design, to include the existing main entranceway and its relationship with the memorial elements.

Committee's recommendation

Mayor Wise / Councillor Taylor

The Future Napier Committee:

That Council:

- a. Adopt the Concept Design for the Perpetual Flame, Roll of Honour, and remembrance/reflection space at the Napier War Memorial Centre.
 - b. Note that upon adoption of the concept design it will be advanced to detailed design stage, ready to support construction.
 - c. Extended the scope of the detailed design, to include the existing main entranceway and its relationship with the memorial elements.
-

-
- d. Note separate papers are coming to Council covering the related topics on: The War Memorial Design, the Floral Clock and the War Memorial Centre Management Policy.
 - e. Endorse the extension of the terms of engagement to the team of architects and consultants.
-

Carried

Attachments

- 1 Concept Design presentation by Architects44 on War Memorial Centre
 - 2 Flyer of War Memorial Centre Design circulated at the meeting
-

Minor Matter

Gaming Grant application by Council – Councillor Boag commented that a discussion point raised during the hearings of the Gambling Venue Policy was whether Council should reconsider the practise of applying for Grants derived from the takings of pokie machines in light of the social harm these machines cause, and in reflection of the sinking lid policy that was adopted.

The meeting agreed that staff be requested to prepare a paper and workshop, including how much Council has received from gaming grants in the last ten years, to provide an opportunity to explore whether or not Council wish to continue applying for this funding. The paper is also to include where alternative sources of funding could be applied from.

The meeting closed at 12.55pm

Approved and adopted as a true and accurate record of the meeting.

Chairperson

Date of approval